

Harnessing the Power of an EF5 Tornado for Disaster Education: An Educator's Lesson Plan

Lindon Ratliff

Teacher Education and Leadership
Mississippi State University

Kellie Fondren

Teacher Education and Leadership
Mississippi State University

Importance of Disaster Education

The purpose of disaster education is to increase people's resilience to disasters and help them to be prepared for disasters (Ronan & Towers, 2014). People's unpreparedness for natural disasters increases the risk of disaster. Natural events that create disasters usually occur suddenly, often cannot be stopped after they have started, and can cause great loss of life and property (Senturk, 2023). Studies have revealed that proactive measures taken in anticipation of disasters can significantly contribute to saving lives, minimizing injuries, and protecting property and crucial infrastructure. As a result, communities become better equipped to recover and bounce back swiftly from such adversities (Johnson et al., 2014).

Beginning disaster education at the K-12 level has been identified as the most effective approach (Vitek & Berta, 1982). However, Mitchell's 2009 analysis of diverse disaster curriculum methods in K-12 education revealed fragmented and inconsistent curricula, with significant variations based on grade levels and geographic locations (Mitchell, 2009). This lack of cohesion was evident in Georgia's standards, which mentioned only one natural disaster, the Dust Bowl of the 1920s. Mitchell concluded that there was a failure to establish cross-curricular connections between social studies and science subjects, highlighting the need for more consistency in social studies standards. Recent research by Saregar et al., in 2022 further emphasized the urgency of addressing disaster education in schools, as insufficient international research collaboration exists, particularly at the elementary, secondary, and high school levels. To enhance disaster preparedness, it is crucial to address these challenges and develop comprehensive disaster education programs.

While disaster education is developing curriculum, the specific instruction regarding tornados is sparse. Wilcox & Sterling (2006) developed a five day lesson plan for science teachers. It followed the 5-E model (Engage, Explore, Explain, Elaborate, and Evaluate) for incorporating constructivism into science teaching. The 5-E model was developed by Roger Bybee in 1996. While their model was geared more towards the structure and composition of tornados it did demonstrate effective lesson plan creation for the science classroom when dealing with tornados.

Some educators may be tempted to analyze tornadoes through the perspectives shared in oral histories. Nevertheless, it is essential to exercise caution with this approach. Tornadoes are notorious for their unpredictability, and this very nature can make the narratives surrounding them subjective and reflective. Traumatic experiences that catch individuals off-guard tend to be remembered under the influence of stress and emotion. A stressful event being recalled that was unprepared for can lead to events being left out or some specific moments amplified (Bauer et al., 2007).

The utilization of instructional videos has emerged as one of the most significant tools in tornado education. These videos provide students with dynamic visual content that can be both engaging and informative. In some educational settings, there has been a growing trend of experimenting with alternative teaching methods by replacing traditional classroom instruction with pre-recorded YouTube videos. This approach has yielded positive results in specific areas, offering flexibility and accessibility to students.

However, it is important to approach this shift with caution, particularly when tackling contentious and sensitive subjects within the realm of tornado education, such as the devastating consequences of tornado fatalities. While videos can be a valuable resource, they should not be used as a standalone replacement for teacher-led instruction. In cases where sensitive topics are involved, such as tornado fatalities, educators have a crucial role to play. They must step in and provide essential context and guidance to ensure that students receive a well-rounded and emotionally responsible education. This approach ensures that students not only gain factual knowledge but also learn to process and empathize with the human and environmental impacts of tornadoes. By integrating videos into a comprehensive instructional framework that includes discussions, Q&A sessions, and supportive teacher involvement, educators can foster a deeper understanding of tornadoes and their consequences (Fyfield, 2022).

Furthermore, it is essential to assess the readiness and emotional maturity of students before presenting potentially distressing video content. Educators should offer appropriate warnings and be prepared to provide emotional support to students who may be affected by the sensitive subject matter. In summary, while instructional videos are a valuable tool in tornado education, they should be used in conjunction with traditional teaching methods. This hybrid approach, when executed thoughtfully, ensures that students receive a well-rounded and emotionally responsible education on tornadoes, including their potentially devastating consequences. It is through this holistic approach that students can gain a deeper understanding of the topic and develop empathy for those affected by tornadoes.

Focusing the Lesson Plan on Time

Only one in four tornado warnings are confirmed as actual tornadoes. As a result, tornado warnings have the highest false alarm rate among all national emergencies, standing at 76% (Barnes et al., 2007). The relationship between warnings and fatalities challenges common intuition. A lead time of up to 15 minutes reduces the fatality rate, and a warning window spanning from 6 to 10 minutes results in a 41% decrease in expected fatalities when compared to a similar tornado scenario with no warning. Conversely, prolonging warnings beyond 15 minutes leads to higher fatality rates compared to no warning at all. When warnings are in effect and have longer lead times, they effectively decrease the incidence of injuries in comparison to a storm without any warning. The most significant reduction in injuries occurs when the lead time falls within the range of 11 to 15 minutes, resulting in a 47% reduction in anticipated injuries (Simmons & Sutter, 2008). Television was the most commonly cited warning source (89%), followed by telephone calls (37%), sirens (37%), and AM/FM radio (25%). Furthermore, 55% of individuals received the warning through multiple sources. Before the tornado struck, nearly half (47%) of the residents had evacuated their homes (Hammer & Schmidlin, 2002).

Individual Case Study for Lesson Plan

On the fateful afternoon of April 27, 2011, a catastrophic EF-5 tornado unleashed its destructive fury upon the serene town of Smithville, Mississippi. This calamitous event etched its mark in history, owing to an unprecedented meteorological phenomenon that swept across the Southeastern United States on that very day, spawning an astonishing 199 tornadoes. Among this tumultuous whirlwind, four of these tornadoes were ominously designated with the highest EF-5 rating, signifying their sheer devastation.

Tragically, the April 27th tornado outbreak exacted a grievous toll, claiming the lives of 316 individuals. This entire period, spanning from April 25th to April 28th, 2011, would go down in infamy as the "Super Outbreak," encompassing an astonishing total of 360 tornadoes and resulting in a staggering 324 fatalities. The financial repercussions of this devastating rampage were monumental, with estimated damages soaring to a staggering 15.5 billion dollars. (Knupp et al., 2014).

The choice to study Smithville's EF-5 tornado is particularly significant due to the unique circumstances surrounding the events leading up to it. A local meteorologist, live on television, diligently tracked the storm for over an hour before its devastating impact. These critical moments were documented and are still preserved in archived videos to this day. Moreover, in the months following the tornado, numerous scientists conducted in-depth video analyses, providing a wealth of valuable information.

This abundance of diverse sources presents an exceptional opportunity for students to triangulate data, fostering a deeper and more comprehensive understanding of the unfolding events. By examining the live broadcasts, post-storm video analyses, and other available resources, students can gain valuable insights into the meteorological factors, warning systems, and community responses that played a pivotal role in the Smithville tornado. This case study serves not only as a historical record but also as an educational resource to enhance our understanding of tornado events and preparedness.

Lesson Plan

Summary

The objective of this lesson plan is to establish a link between tornado safety measures and the required response time within a community context. We will utilize the Smithville tornado as a case study to illustrate these concepts, encouraging students to engage in hands-on learning by watching videos and conducting time analyses. Through this exercise, students will gain insights into the crucial factors influencing tornado safety and the importance of prompt responses in safeguarding communities.

Objectives

By the conclusion of this lesson, students will demonstrate their ability to:

1. Examine the Smithville 2011 EF5 Tornado Case Study:

- Investigate the key details and factors associated with the Smithville tornado, gaining a comprehensive understanding of its impact on the community.

2. Analyze News Coverage vs. Real-Time Events:

- Critically assess news coverage of the Smithville tornado and compare it to the actual real-time events, identifying any discrepancies or areas where accurate information is crucial.

3. Formulate Tornado Safety Plans for Diverse Settings:

- Create tornado safety plans tailored to various locations, emphasizing the importance of timely and effective responses to tornado threats.

In achieving these objectives, students will develop a well-rounded comprehension of tornado safety practices, response times, and their pivotal role in safeguarding communities during tornado events.

Grade Level

9th thru 12th

Time Frame

90 minutes (block schedule)

Subject

Introduction to Geography

Topic

Dangerous weather

Standards

College, Career and Civic Life (C3) Geography Standard D2.Geo.2.9-12, D2. Geo.1.9-12

College and Career Readiness Standards ITG.9 “Illustrate how human systems develop in response to physical environment conditions.”

Substandard 3: Compare and contrast how people and nations deal with weather, climate, natural disasters and environmental hazards.

Suggested Teaching Procedures:

1. Introduction (10 minutes):

- Begin the lesson by welcoming the students and providing an overview of what they will learn.
- Introduce the Smithville tornado case study, including its location, date, and impact on the community.
- Explain the learning objective: To analyze the case study and correlate tornado safety practices with response time.

2. Tornado Safety Practices (15 minutes):

- Present an overview of tornado safety practices, highlighting key points such as identifying safe shelters, monitoring weather alerts, creating emergency kits, and having a family emergency plan.
- Use visuals or real-life examples to illustrate these practices.

3. Response Time Importance (10 minutes):

- Discuss why response time is critical during tornado events. Emphasize the role it plays in ensuring community safety.
- Share statistics or stories that highlight the consequences of delayed responses.

4. Smithville Tornado Case Study Presentation (10 minutes):

- Share information and data related to the Smithville tornado case study, including the tornado's touchdown time, warning issuance time, and any response time statistics you have.

5. Time Analysis Exercise (15 minutes):

- Distribute worksheets or handouts with data related to response times for the Smithville tornado case study.
- Instruct students to calculate response times for different scenarios. Encourage them to work individually or in pairs.
- Walk around the classroom to provide assistance and answer questions.

6. Group Discussion (10 minutes):

- Bring the class back together for a group discussion. Ask students to share their findings and observations from the time analysis exercise.
- Encourage critical thinking by asking questions like, "What did you discover about the relationship between response time and tornado safety?"

- Use the whiteboard or flipchart to record key points.
- 7. Significance of Prompt Responses (10 minutes):**
- Lead a discussion on the significance of prompt responses during tornado events. Encourage students to connect their findings from the exercise with the importance of preparedness and quick action.
 - Discuss how this knowledge can be applied to real-life situations.
- 8. Real-Life Examples (5 minutes):**
- Share brief real-life examples of other tornado events where response time played a critical role in community safety. This reinforces the lesson's key points.
- 9. Conclusion and Summarization (5 minutes):**
- Summarize the main takeaways from the lesson and review the learning objective.
 - Ask if there are any remaining questions or if students would like to share additional insights.
- 10. Assessment (5 minutes):**
- Assign a short quiz, reflection, or discussion question to assess students' understanding of the topic. This can be done as homework or in class, depending on your preferences and time constraints.
- 11. Homework/Extension Activities (5 minutes):**
- Assign homework or extension activities related to tornado safety practices, such as creating a family emergency plan or researching other tornado case studies.
- 12. Additional Resources (2 minutes):**
- Provide students with additional resources or references for further reading and research if they want to explore the topic further.
- 13. Closure (2 minutes):**
- Thank the students for their participation and remind them of the next class or any upcoming assignments.

Materials Needed:

- Presentation slides or materials about the Smithville tornado case study.
- Data related to the Smithville tornado (e.g., touchdown time, warning time, response time).
- Worksheets or handouts for the time analysis exercise.
- Whiteboard or flipchart and markers.
- Access to relevant online resources or videos (optional).

Essential Questions

1. Why is it important for communities to be prepared for tornadoes, and how can preparedness save lives?
2. What factors contribute to the effectiveness of tornado safety practices, and how can they vary from one community to another?
3. How does response time impact the safety of individuals and communities during tornado events, and what are the consequences of delayed responses?
4. What lessons can we learn from the Smithville tornado case study about the importance of timely warnings and preparedness?
5. How can technology and advancements in meteorology help improve tornado warnings and response times?
6. What role do individuals and families play in tornado preparedness, and how can they actively contribute to their own safety?
7. What are the challenges faced by communities in implementing and maintaining tornado safety practices, and how can these challenges be addressed?
8. How do emergency management agencies and local governments coordinate their efforts to ensure prompt responses during tornado events?
9. Are there disparities in tornado preparedness and response times between different communities, and if so, what factors contribute to these disparities?
10. How can individuals and communities strike a balance between maintaining normalcy and being prepared for sudden tornado events?

Performance Tasks Options

1. **Emergency Preparedness Plan (Individual or Group Task):**
 - Have students create an emergency preparedness plan for a hypothetical community at risk of tornadoes. This plan should include identifying safe shelters, designing an evacuation route, and outlining communication strategies. Students can present their plans to the class, explaining their choices and rationale.
2. **Response Time Simulation (Individual or Group Task):**

- Use a scenario-based simulation exercise where students must respond to a tornado warning. Provide them with a timeline and ask them to make decisions about when and how to seek shelter, communicate with family members, and access emergency supplies. Assess their choices based on response time and safety.
3. **Case Study Analysis (Individual or Group Task):**
 - Assign students a different tornado case study, similar to the Smithville tornado, and ask them to analyze it. They should identify key factors related to response time, community preparedness, and the impact on safety. Students can then present their findings and compare their assigned case study to Smithville's experience.
 4. **Public Service Announcement (PSA) Creation (Individual or Group Task):**
 - In small groups or individually, have students create a public service announcement (PSA) about tornado safety and the importance of timely responses. They can use multimedia elements, such as videos, posters, or social media content, to convey their message effectively.
 5. **Community Preparedness Audit (Group Task):**
 - Divide students into groups and assign each group a different community or neighborhood. Have them research and assess the tornado preparedness of their assigned area, including the availability of shelters, emergency communication systems, and public awareness. Students can then present their findings and suggest improvements.
 6. **Debate: Balancing Safety and Normalcy (Group Task):**
 - Organize a debate where students argue for or against the proposition that communities should always prioritize safety over normalcy during tornado events. This task encourages critical thinking and requires students to defend their positions with evidence and reasoning.
 7. **Weather Forecasting and Warning System Evaluation (Individual or Group Task):**
 - Have students investigate the advancements in weather forecasting and warning systems, including technologies like Doppler radar and smartphone apps. They should evaluate how these advancements have contributed to reducing response times during tornado events.
 8. **Emergency Response Plan Simulation (Group Task):**
 - Simulate a tabletop exercise where students, representing emergency management agencies or local governments, develop and execute an emergency response plan for a tornado scenario. Evaluate their decision-making processes and effectiveness in reducing response times

Assessment Options

Assessing students' understanding and mastery of the material is a crucial part of any lesson. In the context of your lesson on analyzing the Smithville tornado case study and tornado safety practices, here are some assessment ideas:

1. Quiz or Test:

- Create a written quiz or test that covers key concepts related to tornado safety practices, the Smithville tornado case study, and the importance of response time. Include multiple-choice questions, short answers, and essay questions.

2. Time Analysis Exercise:

- Evaluate students' ability to analyze response times by providing a new set of data related to a different tornado event. Ask them to calculate response times and draw conclusions based on their calculations.

3. Presentation or Report:

- Have students or groups prepare a presentation or written report summarizing their analysis of the Smithville tornado case study. They should emphasize the correlation between safety practices and response time.

4. Emergency Preparedness Plan:

- Assign students to create an emergency preparedness plan for their own household or a hypothetical community. Evaluate the completeness and effectiveness of their plans based on criteria you provide.

5. Debate or Discussion:

- Assess students' ability to articulate their understanding by participating in a debate on a tornado-related topic, such as balancing safety with normalcy during tornado events. Evaluate their arguments, evidence, and critical thinking.

6. Public Service Announcement (PSA) Evaluation:

- If students create PSAs about tornado safety, assess the effectiveness of their message delivery, creativity, and the accuracy of the information they present.

7. **Simulation Performance:**

- If you conduct a simulation exercise, assess how students perform during the simulation, particularly in terms of decision-making related to response times and safety measures.

8. **Case Study Analysis:**

- Assign students different tornado case studies similar to Smithville's and evaluate their ability to analyze and draw conclusions from these cases. Assess their understanding of response time and preparedness.

9. **Peer Assessment:**

- Encourage students to provide constructive feedback to their peers during group activities or presentations. This not only assesses their understanding but also their ability to evaluate and critique others' work.

10. **Reflection Journals:**

- Ask students to maintain reflection journals throughout the lesson. In these journals, they can record their thoughts, questions, and insights about tornado safety practices and response times. Collect and review these journals periodically.

11. **Interviews or Oral Examinations:**

- Conduct one-on-one interviews or oral examinations with students to assess their comprehension and ability to discuss the importance of response time in tornado safety.

12. **Homework Assignments:**

- Assign homework that requires students to research and write about a specific aspect of tornado safety or a related case study. Assess the quality of their research and writing.

13. **Class Participation:**

- Evaluate students' engagement and participation during class discussions, group activities, and interactive exercises related to tornado safety.

14. **Peer Evaluation:**

- Allow students to assess the contributions of their peers in group projects or discussions. Consider their peer evaluations when assessing individual and group performance.

15. **Self-Assessment:**

- Encourage students to self-assess their understanding and progress throughout the lesson. Have them identify areas where they feel confident and areas where they may need further improvement.

Differentiated Instruction

Remediation

Should students encounter difficulties in achieving these objectives, additional resources and activities will be made available:

1. **Interactive Case Studies:** Supplementary case studies with guided questions will be provided to help students further practice their analysis skills, enabling a deeper understanding of tornado events.
2. **Real-Time News Analysis:** Students will be given access to archived news coverage and real-time data for other historical tornado events, allowing them to compare and contrast different situations to enhance their analytical abilities.
3. **Scenario-Based Exercises:** Practical exercises will be conducted, simulating tornado scenarios in various settings (e.g., home, school, workplace) to reinforce the creation of effective safety plans.
4. **Group Discussions:** Collaborative group discussions will encourage students to share their insights and learn from their peers, fostering a supportive learning environment.
5. **Access to Expert Guidance:** Students will have the opportunity to seek guidance and clarification from the instructor during dedicated office hours or through online communication channels.

Enrichment Activities

To further engage and challenge students who have mastered the lesson objectives, the following enrichment activities will be offered:

1. **Tornado Preparedness Workshops:** Organize workshops or guest speaker sessions with meteorologists, emergency responders, or disaster management experts. Students can gain insights into cutting-edge tornado forecasting technologies and emergency response strategies.
2. **Community Outreach Projects:** Encourage students to collaborate with local community organizations to create educational materials or host events focused on tornado preparedness. This real-world application of their knowledge can foster a sense of civic responsibility.
3. **Field Trips:** Organize field trips to weather monitoring stations, emergency management centers, or disaster response facilities. These visits can provide students with firsthand exposure to the tools and procedures used in tornado monitoring and response.
4. **Debate on Tornado Policies:** Hold a classroom debate on tornado-related policies and strategies, such as the effectiveness of building codes, funding allocation for tornado research, or the role of media in disseminating tornado warnings. This activity encourages critical thinking and argumentation skills.
5. **Tornado Photography or Art Contest:** Challenge students to express their understanding of tornadoes through photography or art. This creative outlet allows them to explore the emotional and visual aspects of tornadoes.

These enrichment activities offer students the opportunity to deepen their understanding of tornadoes and disaster preparedness while encouraging creativity, critical thinking, and community engagement.

References

- Barnes, L. R., Grunfest, E. C., Hayden, M. H., Schultz, D. M., & Benight, C. (2007). False Alarms and Close Calls: A Conceptual Model of Warning Accuracy. *Weather and Forecasting*, 22(5), 1140–1147. <https://doi.org/10.1175/WAF1031.1>
- Bauer, P. J., Burch, M. M., Van Abbema, D. L., & Ackil, J. K. (2007). Talking about Twisters: Relations between Mothers' and Children's Contributions to Conversations about a Devastating Tornado. *Journal of Cognition and Development*, 8(4), 371–399. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15248370701612936>
- Fyfield, M. (2022). YouTube in the Secondary Classroom: How Teachers Use Instructional Videos in Mainstream Classrooms. *Technology, Pedagogy and Education*, 31(2), 185–197. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1475939X.2021.1980429>
- Hammer, B., & Schmidlin, T. W. (2002). Response to Warnings during the 3 May 1999 Oklahoma City Tornado: Reasons and Relative Injury Rates. *Weather and Forecasting*, 17(3), 577–581. [https://doi.org/10.1175/1520-0434\(2002\)017<0577:RTWDTM>2.0.CO;2](https://doi.org/10.1175/1520-0434(2002)017<0577:RTWDTM>2.0.CO;2)
- Johnson, V. A., Ronan, K. R., Johnston, D. M., & Peace, R. (2014). Evaluations of disaster education programs for children: A methodological review. *International Journal of Disaster Risk Reduction*, 9, 107–123. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijdr.2014.04.001>
- Mitchell, J. (2009). Hazards education and academic standards in the Southeast United States. *International Research in Geographical and Environmental Education*, 18, 134–148. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10382040902861221>
- Ronan, K. R., & Towers, B. (2014). Systems Education for a Sustainable Planet: Preparing Children for Natural Disasters. *Systems*, 2(1), Article 1. <https://doi.org/10.3390/systems2010001>
- Senturk, M. (2023). Social Studies Pre-Service Teachers' Educational Comics Experience for Disaster Education. *International Journal on Social and Education Sciences*, 5(1), 153–166.
- Vitek, J. D., & Berta, S. M. (1982). Improving perception of and response to natural hazards: The need for local education. *Journal of Geography*, 81(6), 225–228. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00221348208980740>
- Wilcox, D. R., & Sterling, D. R. (2006). Twisters, Tall Tales, & Science Teaching. *Science Scope*, 29(8), 36–41.